matter is closed. Please sit down... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : The Centre can give directions to the State Government under article 365 and they should give a direction under article 365.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let the Government do it... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN : We want to know... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is not my duty to send directions.. (*Interruptions*)

Re-Misleading propaganda by Pakistan Television on Satallite T. V.

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI : (Gujarat) : Madam. I want to raise an issue which, I am sure, the entire House cutting across party lines, would support. Madam, recently, Pakistan Television—I don't know whether it is through any kind of a STAR system or whatever it is—blatantly telecasts every day—PTV-2 is the caption which I see, and this, I understand, is beamed by Pakistan Television—and, Madam, what concerns me most is the kind of propaganda that they are making, specially on Kashmir which is our land, and the people of Kashmir are being misled with this propaganda, with this humbug. Madam, if this continues, it is going to have an adverse effect not only on the people of Kashmir but on the entire country. I would like to have a statement from the Home Minister and the Information and Broadcasting Minister. Madam, our own satellite, INSAT, is so very powerful. I don't understand why we are not using our own facility, why we are not even commercialising that. Why do we have to depend on STAR TV, PTV-2, etc.? Madam, I appreciate the right to information. I am totally for the right to information. But the people cannot be given the right to disinformation. This is a design by Pakistan and I am sure the entire House will associate with me in condemning this and we would like to have a statement from the Government, if possible today itself, as to what action they are taking against this and to curb this.

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

RE-DEMAND FOR STATEMENT ON THE REPORTED INVOLVEMENT OF PRIME MINISTER'S SON'S COMPANY IN THE SECURITIES SCAM

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan) : Madam, yesterday I had raised a matter relating to the Prime Minister's son's company and the Government has not come with a statement so far. The Government's silence is deafening... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN (Maharashtra) : It is a special matter and it is pending for the last three days... (*Interruptions*)...For the last three days, we have been raising this issue... (*Interruptions*)...

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह (बिहार) : हमने मांग की थी कि प्रधानमंत्री आकर इस सदन में बयान दें लेकिन न तो प्रधानमंत्री की तरफ से कोई बयान आया, न सरकार की तरफ से कोई बयान आया । मैं जानना चाहता हूं कि सदन की मर्यादा रखी जाएगी या नहीं ।

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry) : JPC will take care of it... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : It is not about JPC... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : They have been raising this issue for the last three days... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : Madam, I want your ruling... (*Interruptions*). I want your ruling, Madam... (*Interruptions*)..

श्री विष्णुकांत शास्त्री (उत्तर प्रदेश) : महोदया, यह पक्षपात नहीं होना चाहिए ... (**व्यवधान**) प्रधानमंत्री को स्पष्टीकरण देना चाहिए ।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The Minister is saying something... (*Interruptions*)...

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह : जे.पी.सी. का यह मतलब नहीं है कि प्रधानमंत्री का लड़का लूट ले जाए इस देश को ... (**व्यवधान**) जैसे और लोगों को गिरफ्तार किया गया, आज उसी तरह प्रधानमंत्री का लड़का * भी गिरफ्तार होना चाहिए (**व्यवधान**) ...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : Their own Member is there in the JPC.... (*Interruptions*)... Madam, their Member

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

is there in the JPC... (*Interruptions*)... What are you going to say now? (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will allow you. But she is replying to it... (*Interruptions*)...She will reply to it. The Parliamentary Affairs Minister will reply to it... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : For the last three days, they are raising this issue when the matter is engaging the attention of the JPC... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : She will reply to it. The Parliamentary Affairs Minister will reply to it. Let him finish first.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : I am raising nothing concerning the JPC. I am misunderstood. I am raising nothing about the JPC. Madam, please bear with me.... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu) : The issue will be considered by the JPC... (*Interruptions*)... Not only that... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : JPC is a product of this House.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : Just because the JPC is there, do you want say that corruption cannot be discussed in the House?... (*Interruptions*)...Till the JPC completes its work, matters of corruption cannot be discussed! What kind of parliamentary democracy do we have?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not able to hear anybody. How can I... (*Interruptions*)...Shrimati Margaret Alvaji, you are saying something... (*Interruptions*)... आप कुछ कह रही हैं।

श्री **प्रमोद महाजन** : यह मामला तीन दिन से चल रहा है। लगातार विपक्ष की ओर से मांग हो रही है कि हितेन दलाल ने जो 2 करोड़ रुपया दिया है और जिसमें प्रधानमंत्री का नाम घसीटा जा रहा है, उनके नाम की बदनामी हो रही है और सरकार चुप बैठी उसको मूक सम्मति दे रही है। हम चाहते हैं कि सरकार इस पर बयान दे। अगर गलत हो तो खंडन करे। तीन दिन से यहां पर .... (**व्यवधान**)

उपसभापति : जवाब दे रही हैं न। मारग्रेट अल्वा जी इस बारे में कुछ बोल रही हैं। आप लोग अगर चुप होंगे तभी तो जवाब देंगी ... (**व्यवधान**)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : Yesterday also, the same issue was raised... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : She is replying. If you keep quiet, she will answer something... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ARANGIL SREEDHARAN (Kerala) : Madam, I have a point to make... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Madam, I also want to speak.. (*Interruptions*) ..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : On the same point?

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Yes, Madam. But let him finish.

SHRI ARANGIL SREEDHARAN : It is a serious thing... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Madam, just a minute... (*Interruptions*)... Just a minute, please... (*Interruptions*)... Madam, just one minute... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Order, order, please... (*Interruptions*)...Order, please... (*Interruptions*)...Mrs. Alva wants to say something... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Madam, I would like to say that whatever charges the National Front and the Left Front, etc. are bringing in here are based entirely on a report in the "Indian Express"... (*Interruptions*)...We cannot believe the "Indian Express"... (*Interruptions*)...It should be by some other responsible newspaper... (*Interruptions*)... This is a motivated BJP propaganda against the Prime Minister... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : Madam, the "Indian Express" is publishing all rubbish... (*Interruptions*)...The "Indian Express" is publishing all rubbish and you people want to believe in that?... (*Interruptions*)...The "Indian Express" is publishing all rubbish... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute, please... (*Interruptions*)... Mrs. Alva would like to reply... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : Madam, while the JPC is on, corruption can go on ?... (*Interruptions*)...So long as the JPC is there, corruption cannot be discussed and it can go on ?... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : It is financed by the Rama.a of Gwalior ... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Will you please sit down, everybody ?...

आप लोग बैठिए, मिसेज आल्वा जवाब दे रही हैं, उनका जवाब तो सुन लीजिए । ...(व्यवधान)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal) : Madam, why is the Prime Minister himself not replying ?... (*Interruptions*)...The Prime Minister should extricate himself from this affair... (*Interruptions*)... Why should Mrs. Alva reply ?... (*Interruptions*) ...

उपसभापति : बैठिए, उनका जवाब तो सुन लीजिए... **(व्यवधान)**

श्री दीपेन घोष : क्या जवाब देंगी ? ... **(व्यवधान)** ...

उपसभापति : मुझे क्या मालूम, क्या जवाब देंगी ? आप पहले सुन लीजिए... **(व्यवधान)**

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : It is an irresponsible paper. So, how can we take it as true ?... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Order, order, please... (*Interruptions*)... Please take your seat, Mr. Afzal... (*Interruptions*)...I do not want anything here. Please go back to your seat, Mr. Salim. This is not the proper way. Please take your seat... (*Interruptions*)...Yesterday, Mr. Morarka and many other Members raised this issue and they said that the sentiments of the House should be conveyed ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : I raised it the day before yesterday... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Yes. The assurance that I gave was that the Parliamentary Affairs Minister would convey the sentiments of the House to the Government and now it is for the Government to come forward and say something... (*Interruptions*)...Now, Mrs. Alva wants to say something and you allow her to say .ome-hing... (*Interruptions*)...Please be quiet. Otherwise she cannot talk so loudly... (*Interruptions*)...

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS WITH ADDITIONAL CHARGE OF THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA) : Madam, I know that the Members will should again when I say someth.ng... (*Interruptions*)...I just want to say that just because there is a report in a newspaper... (*Interruptions*)...Let me complete... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : No, no... (*Interruptions*)...This is an insult to our intelligence... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : Let me complete i.... (*Interruptions*)...I am saying because I want to say and not because you can shout at me... (*Interruptions*)...I will stop speaking then... (*Interruptions*)...

उपसभापति : आप लोग अपनी जगह बैठ जाइए... **(व्यवधान)**

Let her complete her sentence... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : You cannot shout like hat... (*Interruptions*)... I have a right to be heard... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : You see, the JPC was born on the basis of newspapers reports only... (*Interruptions*)... The entire Bofors case started only on the basis of the newspaper reports... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : Let them say what they want to say and I will rebut their statement... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN) Order please... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, I am on a point of order (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Many Members are rising on points of order... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot hear anything at all. There is so much of noise... (*Interruptions*)...

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT): Madam... (*Interruptions*)...

उपसभापति: उनको बात कह लेने दीजिए, उनको जुमला कह लेने दीजिए ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, the issue has been raised by a number of Members from this side for the last two days and it could not be taken up... (*Interruptions*)... But my point is that I am a Member of the JPC and that way I cannot say anything on behalf of the JPC or against it... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Every party has a representative on the JPC ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Madam, he is a Member of the JPC... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes. He is saying that... (*Interruptions*)... He is also saying the same thing... (*Interruptions*)... Mr. Narayanasamy, he is not disputing it. He is admitting that he is a member of the JPC. Listen to him.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Kindly hear me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have heard you. Please let me settle this matter today once for all.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, I am on a point of order. I am on my legs. I am not yielding. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: You cannot raise it.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: It is up to the Chair...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: I am telling the Chair that you cannot raise the issue, you cannot be allowed.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Narayanasamy, please take your seat. When a point of order is raised, I think, I can deal with it. And Mrs. Margaret Alva has already replied. But it is the right of a Member to raise a point of order. And I am capable to deal with it. If I need your help, I will definitely ask for it. So, will you please sit down? (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: They cannot shout us down. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: What about Miss Jayalalitha's income tax violation? Why only about the Prime Minister? This is a Parliament Question... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, we want to raise the income-tax violation of Mr. Subramanian Swamy. Mr. Subramanian Swamy has violated the income-tax law. And we want his income-tax violation to be taken up at the parliamentary level, at the Rajya Sabha level.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam... (*Interruptions*) It will be decided by the JPC, by the Chairman and other Members of the JPC whether any issue will be taken up by the JPC or not. But JPC cannot be a substitute for Rajya Sabha. So, the Rajya Sabha is entitled to discuss the matter relating to the Prime Minister of the country. This is one point. (*Interruptions*) The second point is that Mrs. Margaret Alva stated that it cannot be taken up on the basis of a newspaper report. On a number of occasions in the past, on the basis of newspaper reports, the Rajya Sabha has taken up the issue for discussion like the Kuo Oil deal, like the Indira Pratibha

Prathishtas, the Antulay affairs and the Bofors. (*Interruptions*) So, this was on the basis of a newspaper report.
(*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You want the Government to answer. She wants to answer. You don't allow her. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : The Prime Minister is involved. (*Interruptions*) And a former Member of the Planning Commission was hauled up by the Government.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : She is telling us not to take cognizance of the 'Indian Express'.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : What about income-tax violation of Miss Jayalalitha ?
(*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : As Mr. Subramanian Swamy has stated, if the "Indian Express" has printed something which is not right, then let Mrs. Margaret Alva move a privilege motion against the "Indian Express".

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : There is no privilege violation here.
(*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please take your seats. I have to go ahead with my listed Business.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam, will you allow me ? (*Interruptions*). Did you identify me, Madam ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let them keep quite.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam Deputy Chairperson, I have heard the hon. Minister, Mrs. Margaret Alva very carefully.

AN HON. MEMBER : It was not audible.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : I have somehow managed to hear her in the midst of the din caused by Mr. Narayanasamy and others.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : But she was not allowed by anybody to speak.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Mrs. Margaret Alva did not contradict the facts or otherwise mentioned in the Indian Express'. (*Interruptions*) Let Mrs. Margaret Alva stand up on her feet and contradict the facts. That will put an end to the controversy. Let not the Government evade the issue. Let the Government react to the issue. If the facts are false, let Mrs. Margaret Alva stand up on her feet and say the facts are false.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : She wants to say. But you don't allow her to say. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : It appeared in the papers; it appeared in the *Indian Express*. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : She cannot speak what you want her to speak; she would say what she wants to say.

श्री प्रमोद महाजन : महोदया, सवाल यह है कि यह इण्डियन एक्सप्रेस का सवाल नहीं है । यह खबर इण्डियन एक्सप्रेस में छपी होगी और अगर वह इण्डियन एक्सप्रेस में छपी और वहीं रहती तो यह मामला इण्डियन एक्सप्रेस और प्रधान मंत्री के बीच का मामला था । लेकिन उक्त इण्डियन एक्सप्रेस में खबर छपी और यह खबर यहां सदन में उठी है तो यह इण्डियन एक्सप्रेस में छपा था, छपा, यह महत्व की बात नहीं होती है। उक्त वह राज्य सभा की कार्यवाही का अंग हो गई है । इण्डियन एक्सप्रेस की खबर सच है या असत्य है, लेकिन इससे प्रधान मंत्री और देश का नाम बदनाम हो गया है । अगर सदस्य यह जानना चाहते हैं तो मुझे लगता है कि अगर यह बात असत्य है तो वे खड़े होकर कहें कि यह खबर असत्य है, इस खबर में कोई तथ्य नहीं है, ऐसा वे कह सकते हैं । लेकिन अगर सच है तो वे सदन को बताएं । इसके लिए इण्डियन एक्सप्रेस को घसीटने की कोई जरूरत नहीं है । . . .
(व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, let her speak.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : Madam, anybody is free to report any matter to the JPC if they want it to be enquired into. This is not the first time that reports about various people have been published in the newspapers. There are so many Ministers who have been named in those reports in the papers. The JPC said that they are looking into every single allegation. I would request that since each party has its representative in the JPC, let this issue be taken up there and looked into and investigated as everybody else is being looked into. Let the JPC go into it... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : She is not denying the report ...(*Interruptions*).

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : She has not accepted the report. She said let it be investigated ...(*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That matter is over now.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal) : Madam the JPC...

उपसभापति : यह मामला आपने उठाया, उन्होंने सरकार की तरफ से कह दिया ।

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Even action against Mr. Krishnamurthy did not wait ...(*Interruptions*).

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह : कानून की दृष्टि में हर एक आदमी बराबर है । इसमें किसी प्रकार का अंतर नहीं होना चाहिए... (व्यवधान) ।

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI (Karnataka) : Madam, I have sought your permission.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will allow you; let this matter be over.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA : Madam, Since the JPC is being referred to by Members from this side and that side, I am a Member of the JPC, and I can say that JPC was not formed to look into a particular transaction that has been carried out between one bank and another. The JPC was formed to go into share speculations and manipulation of the market. It is not a part of that. The point raised relates to a particular criminal transaction which is not a part of JPC's investigation ...(*Interruptions*). Ministers cannot take protection under JPC. It is not a part of JPC... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mrs. Natarajan, please go back to your seat.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: I will go back, but ...(*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please go back. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA : Madam, the Government cannot take protection under the JPC. The JPC was set up to look into a particular matter. This is not part of the JPC. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will allow Mr. Sikander Bakht if he wants to speak. But the point is, his voice should be heard. When everybody is speaking, if he also speaks, he would not be heard (*Interruptions*)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : सदर साहिबा, शोर मचाना मेरे बस का नहीं है। मैं तकलीफ में हूं। ... (व्यवधान)

†شری سکندر بخت: صدر صاحبہ۔ شور مچانا میرے بس کا نہیں ہے۔ میں تکلیف میں ہوں ...مداخلت...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mrs Natarajan, we cannot have a point of order. We have no discussion here. It is disorder. I cannot allow you. I did not allow Mr. Subramanian Swamy. (*Interruptions*) I am not allowing. You can not have a point of order now, under the rules. We cannot change the rules according to anybody's requirements. I am not going to do it.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : I will quote Kaul and Shakdher. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Sikander Bakht is the leader of the Opposition Let us respect him. Let him speak. (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam. I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have identified Mr. Sikander Bakht. (*Interruptions*)

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर (उत्तर प्रदेश) : महोदया, यह परम्परा रही है कि जब लीडर आफ अपोजीशन खड़े हों तो कम से कम उन को सुनें। ... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mrs. Natarajan please take your seat.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam. I want to make my point in regard to what Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta had said. (*Interruptions*)

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mrs. Natarajan, please sit down. I know that the terms of reference of the JPC were approved by this House. It cannot be over and above this House. He referred to it. If he had referred to anything else, I will look into the record. We ourselves had approved the terms of reference of the JPC. I will look into the record now, Mr. Sikander Bakht please.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : इसका क्या मतलब है? परम्परा है कि लीडर आफ अपोजीशन जब खड़े हों तो ... (व्यवधान)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : सदर साहिबा, शोर में निबटा लेना मेरे लिए बहुत मुश्किल है। आजीज गरीब बातें हो रही हैं। न्यूज-पेपर्स को सर्टिफिकेट दिए जा रहे हैं। क्या यह हमारा काम है? आखिर इस विषय को यहां बहस में लाने से कतराने की जरूरत क्या है? स्कैम के साथ कोर्ट डील नहीं जा रही है। इतना सीरियस विषय है। प्रधानमंत्री की पोजीशन को साफ करने की जरूरत है और दूसरा हमारी नेचर को मालूम होनी चाहिए कि वह लोग इसको डिसक्लोज करना चाहते हैं और साफ करना चाहते हैं। जे. पी. सी. बनाने की डिमांड पर इसलिए गलत है कि जब हमारे सदन में हो चुका है तो उसका निष्कर्ष इसी सदन में होना चाहिए। जे. पी. सी. क्या कलर लगाती है या लगाना चाहती है, बताया तो यह गया है कि जे. पी. सी. नए मामलों को खड़ा नहीं करना चाहती है। लेकिन यह मसला इतना गम्भीर है कि हर-अपने सेक्टरी लेवल को अपने यहां इसे डिसिप्लिन करना चाहिए, इसको लेना चाहिए ताकि पोजीशन साफ हो सके। मैं यह साफ करूं कि अखबारात का नाम लेकर सर्टिफिकेट देने का हक किसी को नहीं हो सकता है। अगर गलत है कि हकीकत गलत हुआ है तो उन अखबारों के खिलाफ कदम उठाए जाने

चाहिए जो भी कायदे कानून के मुताबिक होता है । लेकिन सिर्फ इसलिए टालते रहना कि जे. पी. सी. के विचाराधीन है, यह बात नामुनासिब है । मैं मांग करता हूं कि प्राइम-मिनिस्टर साहब की पोजीशन को बचाने के लिए इस पर बहस की फौरन इजाजत देनी चाहिए और आपकी तरफ से यह आना चाहिए ।

شری سکندر بخت "مدھیہ پردیش": صدر صاحبہ۔ شور میں حصہ لینا میرے لیے بہت مشکل ہے۔ عجیب و غریب باتیں ہو رہی ہیں۔ نیوز پیپرس کو سرٹیفکیٹ دیئے جا رہے ہیں۔ کیا یہ ہمارا کام ہے۔ آخر اس اشیو کو یہاں بحث میں لانے سے کترانے کی ضرورت کیا ہے۔ صفائی کے ساتھ کوئی بات کہی نہیں جا رہی ہے۔ اتنا سیریس اشیو ہے۔ پردھان منتری کی پوزیشن کو صاف کرنے کی ضرورت ہے اور دراصل ٹریژری بینچیز کو دعوت دینی چاہیے کہ ہم لوگ اس کو ڈسکس کرنا چاہتے ہیں اور صاف کرنا چاہتے ہیں۔ جے۔ پی۔ سی۔ وغیرہ کی بنیاد پر اس لیے غلط ہے کہ جب ہمارے سدن میں آ چکا ہے تو اس کا ڈسکشن اسی سدن میں ہونا چاہیے۔ جے۔ پی۔ سی۔ کیا قدم اٹھاتی ہے یا اٹھانا چاہتی ہے۔ بتایا تو یہ گیا ہے کہ۔ جے۔ پی۔ سی۔ نئے مسئلوں کو کھڑا نہیں کرنا چاہتی ہے۔ لیکن یہ مسئلہ اتنا نازک ہے کہ دراصل ٹریژری بینچیز کو اپنے آپ اسے انیسیٹیٹ کرنا چاہیے۔ اس کو لینا چاہیے تاکہ پوزیشن صاف ہو سکے۔

مجھے معاف کریں کہ اخبارات کا نام لیکر سرٹیفکیٹ دینے کا حق کسی کو نہیں ہو سکتا ہے۔ اگر سمجھتے ہیں کہ بہت غلط ہوا ہے تو ان اخباروں کے خلاف قدم اٹھائے جانے چاہیے جو بھی قاعدے قانون کے مطابق ہوتا ہے۔ لیکن صرف اسلیے ٹالتے رہنا جے۔ پی۔ سی۔ کے وچار ادھین ہے۔ یہ بات نامناسب ہے۔ میں مانگ کرتا ہوں کہ پرائم منسٹر صاحب کی پوزیشن کو بچانے کے لیے اس پر بحث کی فوراً اجازت دینی چاہیے اور آپ کی طرف سے یہ آنا چاہیے "ختم شد"

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, enough has been said on it. Shall we go ahead with some other Business ? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL (Bihar) : Madam, I want to say something on this. Please give me one minute (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, you had permitted me to raise another issue. I had asked for your permission in the morning. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : We have some other issue, Gujral saheb We have other issues, important issues.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : Please give me one minute. Just half-a-minute.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : All right. One minute.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : I have given, some of us have given a notice of privilege against the 'Indian Express'. In the spirit of what the Leader of the

[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

Opposition has said, I think the reputation and prestige of the House has been damaged. We should take note of it. Therefore, I have moved, some of us have moved, a privilege motion against the 'Indian Express'. We give notice of it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have been informed by the Secretariat that, today, you have given a notice of privilege, just now. It will be considered by the Chairman and, in his own wisdom, whatever decision he takes, he will take it. This matter is closed now. (*Interruptions*) Everybody has spoken on it. I think we have spent 35 minutes on it. अब हो गया।

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय (उत्तर प्रदेश) : आपने कल एक व्यवस्था दी थी, मुझे उस पर कहना है। **(व्यवधान)**

उपसभापति : महिला और पुरुष का सवाल नहीं है। **(व्यवधान)**

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय : आपकी अनुमति है क्या ?

उपसभापति : किस विषय में ?

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय : कमल मोरारका जी, उपेन्द्र जी, दीपेन घोष जी और प्रमोद महाजन जी ने कल इस चीज को उठाया था और आपने उस पर यह व्यवस्था दी थी कि

"The Minister of Parliamentary Affairs will convey the feelings of the House to the Government."

अब जब मिनिस्टर आफ पार्लियामेंटरी अफेयर्स बोलीं तो उन्होंने इसका उत्तर नहीं दिया। इसलिए आपकी व्यवस्था का पालन हुआ या नहीं हुआ। आपकी जो व्यवस्था है, मैं उसे पढ़ना चाहता हूं।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I know it, what I said.

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALVIYA : The Deputy Chairman has said :

"The Minister of Parliamentary Affairs will convey the sentiments to the Government."

मैं केवल यह जानना चाहता हूं कि आपकी रूलिंग का पालन हुआ या नहीं हुआ ? कल मिनिस्टर आफ पार्लियामेंटरी अफेयर्स श्रीमती मारग्रेट आल्वा जी... **(व्यवधान)**

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let me find out. I have told Dr. Abrar Ahmed. Mrs. Alva was not there in the House at that time. I told Dr. Abrar Ahmed to convey the sentiments of the House to the Government.

SHRI YASWANT SINHA (Bihar) : Has he done it ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He will say whether he has done it or not.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : Let him say.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Dr. Abrar Ahmed, you answer to the House.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (DR. ABRAR AHMED) : I have conveyed it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He has conveyed it.

जो मैंने उनको आदेश दिया था वह उन्होंने कनवे कर दिया है।

Whatever we conveyed, he has conveyed to them. Whatever they are going to convey, he will convey to the House because he cannot speak on behalf of the Prime Minister. Whatever they want to convey, he will convey to us. Mrs. Margaret Alva also said it.

Now, let us go adead.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (हरियाणा) : उपसभापति महोदया, मुझे केवल दो बातें कहनी हैं **(व्यवधान)**

उपसभापति : आपको कभी किसी और विषय पर बुलवा लेंगे **(व्यवधान)** यह मसला बंद हो गया **(व्यवधान)**

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : मुझे केवल दो बातें कहनी हैं । जब से बैंक घोटाले का प्रश्न सामने आया (**व्यवधान**) ।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That matter we want to close.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : तब से कई मंत्रियों की ओर संदेह की अंगुली उठ रही थी (**व्यवधान**) लेकिन अब तो यह आंच प्रधान मंत्री जी के घर तक पहुंच चुकी है । इस तरह के मामलों को गंभीरता को कम कर के नहीं आंका जा सकता है । मारग्रेट आल्वा जी का यह कहना कि यह न्यूजपेपर्ज की रिपोर्ट है यह तो प्रेस के महत्व को नकारना है । प्रेस प्रजातंत्र का चौथा मजबूत पाया है । इस देश में खोजी पत्रकारों ने कितने ही घोटालों का पर्दाफाश किया है । इसके लिए वे बधाई के पात्र हैं लेकिन मैं यह कहना चाहती हूं (**व्यवधान**)

उपसभापति : चलिए, यह मैटर खत्म ।

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : मैं यह कहना चाहती हूं कि यह मसला अगर असत्य है तो इसके लिए तो एक क्षण की देरी लगाए बिना सरकार को सदन में आकर इसे निराधार साबित करना चाहिए (**व्यवधान**) अभी तो मंत्रियों को भी जे. पी. सी. ने नहीं बुलाया है (**व्यवधान**) इसलिए सदन में प्रधानमंत्री जी की ओर से बयान आना चाहिए। अगर यह आरोप निराधार है तो इसको तुरन्त बिना एक क्षण की देरी लगाए सदन में आना चाहिए ।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mrs. Alva has replied. Now I will ask Jayanthiji.

Re. : ATROCITIES COMMITTED ON WOMEN DURING RECENT COMMUNAL ROITS IN MAJOR CITIES

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu) : Madam, I want to raise an important issue. The House has been engaged on an issue for the last three days ...(*Interruptions*)

Would you mind hearing me? Are there any other issues you are concerned with ?

Madam, the tragedy is that when this country is burning, these people are concerned with their narrow political objectives unfortunately. This is not political. This is about women.

Madam, four national mowen's organistations have released a report to the Press yesterday on the atrocities commited during the recent communal riots in major cites. Representatives of the four national women's organisations went to all these cities, met a large number of women and children who were hurt in the communal roits. The findings they presented to the Press yesterday, and the report that they released has some very serious and grave allegations against various people. What they found is that most of the riots were planned and that the sexual atrocities against women in all those major cities were also planned. While women from both the communities were able to help each other, unfortunately most of the attacks were planned and targeted on *women from the minority community.* This is a matter of great tragedy, something that the House should take note of. Something should be done about it. Therefore, I demand that the Government should take very seriously the report of the four national women's organisations. The Minister for Women and Child Welfare or the Home Minister should come up with a statement.

The children who have watched these atrocities being perpetrated on their mothers and sisters and their family members need special care. My demand is that in the communal riots, those who have been affected, particularly the women and the children, have to be taken care of immediately. You have to collect authentic and reliable data in this regard.

Immediate steps should be taken, especially for rehabilitation of women and children who are affected as a result of the communal riots.

SHRIMATI KAMLA SINHA (Bihar) : Madam, I associate...